

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF INDIANA
INDIANAPOLIS DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
STATE OF NEW YORK,)	
STATE OF NEW JERSEY,)	
STATE OF CONNECTICUT,)	
HOOSIER ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL)	Case No. 1:99-cv-1693-LJM-JMS
and OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL,)	
)	
Plaintiff-Intervenors,)	
)	
CINERGY CORP., PSI ENERGY, INC.,)	
and THE CINCINNATI GAS & ELECTRIC)	
COMPANY,)	
)	
Defendants.)	

**APPENDIX OF EVIDENCE IN SUPPORT OF
DEFENDANTS’ RESPONSE TO ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE (Dkt. 1508)**

Defendants, Cinergy Corp., PSI Energy, Inc. and the Cincinnati Gas & Electric Company, by counsel, respectfully submit their Appendix, Tabs 1 through 25, inclusive, consisting of evidence cited in its Response To Order to Show Cause electronically filed and served on counsel on January 9, 2009. The following materials are provided:

Description	Tab
Declaration of Dean M. Moesser (2009)	1
Affidavit of Kathryn B. Thomson.....	2
Exhibit A - E-mail between K. Thomson and S. Himmelhoch (June 17, 2005)	
Exhibit B - Excerpts from the 30(b)(6) deposition transcript Robert Batdorf (July 1, 2005)	
Exhibit C - United States Response to Defendants’ First Request for Production Of Documents and Document Interrogatories	
Exhibit D - Affidavit of Darrell D. McElravy	
Exhibit E - Affidavit of Kevin Hammersmith	
Exhibit F - Affidavit of Karla Bauer	
Exhibit G - E-mail between S.Himmelhoch and K. Thomson (March 24, 2004)	

- Exhibit H - Letter from P. Brooks to K. Thomson (September 15, 2005)
- Exhibit I - Excerpts from the deposition of James Bott (November 19, 2004)
- Exhibit J - Excerpts from the deposition of Leonard Baughman
(January 11, 2005)
- Exhibit K - Excerpts from the deposition of Steven Salay (June 23, 2004)
- Exhibit L - Excerpts from the deposition of Robert Batdorf
(September 17, 2004)
- Exhibit M - Excerpts from the 30(b)(6) deposition of Robert Batdorf
(June 30, 2005)
- Exhibit N - E-mail from K. Thomson to T. Benson (September 10, 2008)
- Exhibit O – Defendants’ Objections and Responses to Plaintiffs' Second
Set of Requests for Production of Documents in Remedy Phase
of Case (September 18, 2008)
- Exhibit P - Cinergy’s Revised Preliminary List of Fact Witnesses for
Remedy Phase of Case

Declaration of Julie L. Ezell	3
Affidavit of Mark D. Hopson	4
Affidavit of Robert Batdorf (2009).....	5
Declaration of Thomas Green.....	6
Declaration of Kosta Stanko Stojilkovic.....	7
Affidavit of Meghan Colleen Delaney	8
Affidavit of Frank R. Volpe	9
Affidavit of Samuel B. Boxerman	10
Affidavit of James A. King	11
Affidavit of John D. Papageorge	12
Affidavit of Robert R. Clark	13
Affidavit of Scott R. Alexander	14
Affidavit of Robert Batdorf (2008).....	15
Declaration of Dean M. Moesser (2008)	16

Expert Opinions on the Propriety of the Consulting Agreement and Rate of Compensation

Declaration and Expert Report of Patti Ayars17

1. Qualifications and Rule 26(a)(2) Requirements Ex A, pp. 3-5; Appx A
2. 2005 Consulting Agreement with Mr. Batdorf Ex A, p. 6
3. Consulting Agreement with Mr. Batdorf Signed April 7, 2008 Ex A, p. 8
4. Why the Difference in Pay? Ex A, p. 10
5. Conclusion Ex A, p. 11

Declaration and Expert Report of S.R. Born18

1. Qualifications and Rule 26(a)(2) Requirements..... Ex. A, pp. 2-6
2. Reasons Why Consulting Agreements with Retired Employees are Necessary and Proper..... Ex. A, p. 6
3. Payment for Consulting Services in Agreements with Retired Employees Ex. A, p. 7
4. Consulting Agreements Covering Testimony as a Witness..... Ex. A, p. 9
5. Review and Consideration of Batdorf Agreement..... Ex. A, p. 10
6. Batdorf's Employment Status..... Ex. A, p. 12
7. Conclusion Ex. A, p. 13

Expert Opinions on Compliance with Applicable Discovery Rules

Declaration and Expert Report of Kathleen A. Delaney.....19

1. Qualifications and Rule 26(a)(2) Ex. 1, p. 2; Ex. 1, Ex A-B
2. Rule 26(a)(1)(ii) Initial Disclosure and the 2008 Batdorf Consulting Agreement Ex. 1, p. 3
3. Rule 26(a)(1)(A)(i) Initial Disclosures and the Relevance of Batdorf's Home Address Ex. 1, p. 4
4. Rule 26(a)(1)(A)(i) Initial Disclosures and the Failure to Supplement Mr. Batdorf's Address Post-Retirement to Reflect that he Was Represented by Counsel Ex. 1, p. 4
5. Plaintiffs' Request for Production of Documents No. 17 and the Responsiveness of the 2008 Batdorf Consulting Agreement to this Request Ex. 1, p. 12
6. Plaintiffs' Second Supplemental Request for Production No. 6 and the Responsiveness of the 2008 Batdorf Consulting Agreement to this Request..... Ex. 1, p. 14
7. Conclusion Ex. 1, p. 16

Declaration and Expert Report of Jay Tidmarsh.....20

1. Qualifications and Rule 26(a)(2) Requirements p. 1, Ex. A
2. Rule 26(a)(1) Initial Disclosures and Rule 26(e) Requirements..... p. 2, Ex. A
3. Cinergy's Counsel Complied With Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 26(a)(1) and 26(e) in their Disclosure Regarding Mr. Batdorf.....p. 4-9, Ex. A

4. Failure of Cinergy’s Counsel to Produce Mr. Batdorf’s Consulting Agreement in Response to the Plaintiff’s Document Production Requests was Not Unreasonable.....p. 9-13, Ex. A

Expert Opinions on Rules of Professional Conduct and Ethical Considerations

Declaration and Expert Report of Julia Blackwell Gelinas21

1. Qualifications and Rule 26(a)(2) Requirementsp. 1-2, Ex. A
2. Analysis of Rule 3.4(b) and ABA Interpretation p. 2-3
3. The Agreement with Mr. Batdorf does not Violate the Indiana Rules of Professional Conduct.....p. 3

Declaration and Expert Report of Ronald D. Rotunda22

1. Qualifications and Rule 26(a)(2) Requirementsp. 1-6; Ex 1
2. Opinions Summaryp. 6
3. Discussion Concerning the Ethics of Paying a Fact Witness for Time Preparing for and Giving Live Testimony and the Ethical Considerations Involved with Mr. Batdorfp. 7
4. Conclusionp. 16

February 18, 1991 Sheldon Breskow Letter to David McCrea23

November 1, 1988 Richard Rothman Letter to David McCrea24

Affidavit of Paul E. Gutermann25

Respectfully submitted,

s/John R. Maley
 Larry A. Mackey
 John R. Maley
BARNES & THORNBURG LLP
 11 South Meridian Street
 Indianapolis, Indiana 46204
 Telephone: (317) 236-1313
 Fax: (317) 231-7433
 E-Mail: lmackey@btlaw.com
 jmaley@btlaw.com

Attorneys for Defendants,
 Cinergy Corp., PSI Energy, Inc.
 And the Cincinnati Gas & Electric Company

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 9th day of January, 2009, a copy of the foregoing was filed electronically. Notice of this filing will be sent to the following parties by operation of the Court's electronic filing system. Parties may access this filing through the Court's system.

Crissy Lynn Pellegrin – pellegrin.crissy@epa.gov
Cynthia Marie Ferguson – Cynthia.ferguson@usdoj.gov
Danielle Brody Rosengarten – Danielle.rosengarten@usdoj.gov
Deborah Nicole Behles – Deborah.behles@usdoj.gov
Gaylene Vasaturo – vasaturo.gaylene@epa.gov
Jason A. Dunn – Jason.dunn@usdoj.gov
Jeffrey K. Sands – Jeffrey.sands@usdoj.gov
Jennifer Anne Lukas-Jackson – Jennifer.lukas-jackson@usdoj.gov
Justin Aaron Savage – Justin.savage@usdoj.gov
Katherine Lynn Vanderhook – Katherine.vanderhook@usdoj.gov
Larry Martin Corcoran – larry.corcoran@usdoj.gov
Myles E. Flint, II – myles.flint@usdoj.gov
Phillips Brooks – phillip.brooks@usdoj.gov
Richard Mark Gladstein – Richard.gladstein@usdoj.gov
Steven David Ellis – steven.ellis@usdoj.gov
Thomas Andrew Benson – tom.kieper@usdoj.gov
Dean M. Moesser – dmmoesser@duke-energy.com
Frank R. Volpe – fvolpe@sidley.com
James A. King – jking@porterwright.com
Jayna Morse Cacioppo – jcacioppo@taftlaw.com
Julie L. Ezell – Julie.ezell@duke-energy.com
Kathryn R. Thomson – kthomson@sidley.com
Kosta S. Stojilkovic – kstojilkovic@sidley.com
Mark D. Hopson – mhopson@sidley.com
Meghan Colleen Delaney – mberroya@sidley.com
Samuel B. Boxerman – sboxerman@sidley.com
Thomas Charles Green – tcgreen@sidley.com
John D. Papageorge – jpapageorge@taftlaw.com
Robert R. Clark – rclark@taftlaw.com
Scott R. Alexander – salexander@taftlaw.com
Eugene J. Kelly, Jr. – Eugene.kelly@oag.state.ny.us
J. Jared Snyder – jared.snyder@oag.state.ny.us
Joseph M. Kowalczyk – joseph.kowalczyk@oag.state.ny.us
Michael Joseph Myers – Michael.myers@oag.state.ny.us
R. Keith Guthrie – kgmail@comcast.net
Robert T. Rosenthal – Robert.rosenthal@oag.state.ny.us
Carmel Alice Motherway – carmel.motherway@po.state.ct.us

Kimberly P. Massicotte – Kimberly.massicotte@po.state.ct.us
Carol Lynn DeMarco – carol.demarco@dol.lps.state.nj.us
Christine F. Lewis – Christopher.ball@dol.lps.state.nj.us
Christopher D. Ball – Christopher.ball@dol.lps.state.nj.us
Jean Patrice Reilly – martijon@law.dol.lps.state.nj.us
Jon C. Martin – martijon@law.dol.lps.state.nj.us
Kevin P. Auerbacher – auerbkev@law.dol.lps.state.nj.us
Maurice A. Griffin – Maurice.griffin@dol.lps.state.nj.us
Jonathan F. Lewis – jlewis@catf.us

The following counsel of record has been served via First Class U.S. Mail, postage prepaid on this 9th day of January, 2009:

James A. Murphy
Mary E. Costigan
Stefanie A. Brand
RJ Hughes Justice Complex
25 Market Street, P. O. Box 093
Trenton, NJ 08625

s/John R. Maley

John R. Maley